

Citation: Arshad, F., Nawaz, N., & Kakepoto, I. (2021). Who I Am: Mapping the Reciprocity between Identity Gaps and Interpersonal Relationships in *Kartography*. *Global Language Review*, 17(IV), 84-96. [https://doi.org/10.31703/blr.2021\(VI-IV\).08](https://doi.org/10.31703/blr.2021(VI-IV).08)



Who I Am: Mapping the Reciprocity between Identity Gaps and Interpersonal Relationships in *Kartography*

Faheem Arshad *

Nimra Nawaz†

Inayatullah Kakepoto‡

Abstract

This study aims to explore the notion of identity from a post-modernist perspective in the novel, 'Kartography' by Kamila Shamsie. The concept of identity and its multifarious uptakes in varied fields of study have been revealing to understand the complexity embedded in this notion. The concept of identity and its diverse uptakes in varied study fields reveal the need to know the complexity embedded in this notion. Data of the study were selected from novel passages. Discourse Analysis (DA) and Michael Hecht's 'Communication Theory of Identity' were used as a theoretical framework for the study. This theory explains the concept of identity from the postmodernist perspective and describes four layers of identity, for instance, personal, relational, enacted, and communal. It examines the personal-relational and personal-enacted identity gaps in the characters of the novel under the study. Findings exhibit that novel characters undergo personal-relational and personal-enacted identity gaps, and these gaps negatively influence their interpersonal relationships. Hence, the inherent fluidity of identity has been demonstrated in novel characters.

Key Words: Identity, Identity Gaps, Personal-relational Identity, *Kartography*

Introduction

The concept of identity has evolved and developed from personal to public and social phenomenon over the course of history. This concept is intersectional since it seems to intersect and cross the boundaries of various disciplines. It percolated through different disciplines, and many scholars have echoed different perspectives related to identity. During the enlightenment era, back in the eighteenth century, the self was expressed through reason and logic "self-sufficient subject of action endowed with instrumental rationality" (Gil, 2000: 54). Moving a little forward ahead to the first half of the 19th century: the Romantic age, the notion of identity was evolved one step further, and self was expressed

through emotion and feeling. "This radical individuation was obviously facilitated by expressivism and the notion of nature as a source" (Taylor, 1989: 376). Later, in the field of psychology, Sigmund Freud (1856-1939) gave a new approach to the psychoanalytic self. "Freud had two main aims: first, he was interested in charting a genealogy of individual minds and constructing a scientific method by which to describe workings of the psyche. Second, he was concerned with therapeutic intervention on individual patients and the arguably conservative accomplishment of 'normative' psychosocial behavior" (Bewell & Stokoe, 2006: 60). The study of social elements and factors playing a

* Lecturer, Department of English, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Punjab, Pakistan.

† Research Student, Department of English, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Punjab, Pakistan.

‡ Professor, Department of English, Quaid-e-Awam University of Engineering Science & Technology, Nawabshah, Sindh, Pakistan. Email: kinayat@quest.edu.pk

role in an individual's psychological behavior gave way to the concept of social and collective identities. "The major characteristic of social behavior related this belief is, in the relevant intergroup situations, individuals will not interact as individuals, on the basis of their individual characteristics or interpersonal relationships, but as members of their groups standing in certain defined relationships to members of other groups" (Tajfel & Turner, 2004: 278). The concept of collective identities was addressed by the social theory of identity (1979), which became the reason of the emergence of the process of social categorization, in-group, out-group, labeling, and stereotyping of individuals based on their identification and affiliation with certain wider social category. The recent and the postmodern turn on identity took place when Judith Butler gave the conceptual turn of performance in identity. Hence, the recent shift in the concept of identity is that identity is a discursive practice and dependent upon the context in which it takes place. "Within philosophical discourse itself, the notion of 'the person has received analytic elaboration on the assumption that whatever social context the person is 'in' remains somehow externally related to the definitional structure of personhood, be that consciousness, the capacity for language, or moral deliberation" (Butler, 1999:16). All these approaches related to identity stressed the socio-psychological aspects and the context in which the identity is produced and performed. Lately, the concept of identity has shifted the attention of scholars towards the relation of communication with identity. Communication scholar Michael L. Hecht and his colleagues proposed the 'communication theory of identity. This idea emerged in the 1980s, and the frame of four layers of identity was developed in the 1990s. The potential of studying the social behavior or enactment of the identity of an individual through communicative activities and the concept of identity gaps make this theory of identity somewhat different and distinguishing from the aforementioned approaches of identity.

This paper data comes from a Pakistani novel, 'Kartography' by Kamila Shamsie. The study is interpretive and qualitative in nature and uses 'communication theory of identity and Discourse analysis as a theoretical framework. The existence of

multiple frames of self: personal, relational, enacted, and communal, makes CTI a postmodern approach towards identity. Keeping in view this take of CTI, the paper attempts to study two types of identity gaps: the gap between personal and ascribed relational layer and a personal and enacted layer of identity. This paper is limited to three layers and two gaps: personal, relational, and enacted layer and personal-relational and personal-enacted identity gap. It does not consider the communal layer because collectivities are involved in the communal frame of identity and requires a group-level analysis and observation (Jung & Hecht, 2004: 268).

Kamila Shamsie and Kartography

Kamila Shamsie is a Pakistani-British writer. She has been awarded various awards, e.g., Pakistan Prime Minister's Award for Literature, Patras Bokhari Award, and Women's Prize for Fiction. Her writings often revolve around the axis of cultural identity. The novel 'Kartography', like other novels, encapsulates issues of cultural identity. Kartography is set in Karachi, a populous and cosmo-political city of Pakistan. The novel consists of many themes, for example, friendship, love, cultural identity, and racism. It macroscopically captures a time of civil war in 1971 and presents the effects of this war on interpersonal relationships. The war not only distorts cities and places substantially but also crumbles people emotionally. All novel characters undergo emotional setbacks in one context or the other. The novel commences with the tender childhood events of Raheen and Karim. They are best friends but completely ignorant of the truth about the fiancé swap between their parents, the violent days of the 1971 civil war, and the terror-stricken activities of their city-Karachi. The ongoing turmoil in the country and the truth of the fiancé swap force Ali and Maheen to leave the country with Karim, their son. Zafar and Yasmin also send their daughter Raheen to America to pursue her studies. The physical distance between the two families Raheen, and Karim, makes relationships between the two families complicated. Raheen could not figure out the reason for Karim's indifferent attitude. Meanwhile, Karim gets more obsessed with maps and places, which helps him in forming a big picture of things going around him, and he finally maps out the bitter truth of his and

Raheen's parents' past. Raheen's father broke off the engagement with Karim's mother due to her Bengali bloodline. This overpowering thrust of racism and ethnicity on friendship and love leaves Raheen speechless. She first reacts very strongly but soon forgives her father, and the novel ends up with the union of all the fated relationships.

Study Significance

Michael Hecht and his colleagues developed the communication theory of identity, studying inter and intra-ethnic cultures of African and Mexican Americans. Since then, communication theory of identity is extensively used as a theoretical framework in communication, intercultural communication, sociology, and immigrants' identity gaps in new cultural settings. This research uses communication theory of identity to study identity gaps in fictional characters. Study data is drawn from Pakistani fictive literature. Since this study applies 'communication theory of identity on a Pakistani novel, *Kartography*, so it is significant in two ways. First, this study makes use of a cross-disciplinary approach: it studies fictive literature with the help of a theory from the discipline of communication studies, thus proving CTI as an interdisciplinary theory or research tool. Second, it strives to find out identity gaps between personal-relational and personal-enacted identity in fictional characters of *Kartography*, a Pakistani novel. The study of identifying gaps in Pakistani literature in English is relatively an untapped and unexplored area. So, this study will be a notable addition to the research in Pakistani literature in English.

Research Questions

RQ 1: Is there a positive or negative influence of personal- relational and personal-enacted identity gaps on interpersonal relationships?

RQ 2: Is there a direct or indirect relation between personal-relational, personal-enacted identity gaps and their impact on interpersonal relationships?

Literature Review

This section focuses on the concept of identity, theories of identity, and the politics of identity.

Identity is a highly debated concept. The term 'identity' is widely used in all fields such as philosophy, psychology, sociology, literature, cultural and gender studies. Hence, it is difficult to give a single definition of identity. The concept of identity can be understood in the light of different definitions proposed by scholars ranging from different disciplines. [Hogg and Abrams \(1988:2\)](#) consider identity as "people's concepts of who they are, of what sort of people they are, and how they relate to others". Identity is "people's concepts of who they are, of what sort of people they are, and how they relate to others" ([Hogg and Abrams, 1988: 2](#)) "The term [identity] (by convention) references mutually constructed and evolving images of self and other" ([Katzenstein, 1996: 59](#)). "Identity is defined as the linguistic construction of membership in one or more social groups or categories" ([Kroskrity, 2008: 111](#)). These definitions of identity give the perspective that a person's self is constructed through the process of social interaction. An individual's identity can be represented through the three levels of self: individual/personal, relational/interpersonal, and collective/group. "Personal identity is a set of attributes, beliefs, desires, or principles of action that a person thinks to distinguish her in socially relevant ways" ([Fearon, 1999: 25](#)). An individual self is established with reference to the specific characteristics or traits that make an individual different from another. Identity also "refers to the ways in which individuals and collectivities are distinguished in their social relations with other individuals and collectivities" ([Jenkins, 1996: 4](#)). Therefore, a relational self involves the role-relationships of an individual, and a collective identity represents an inclusion or association of an individual to a wider social category.

Collective self is also viewed as a "shift towards the perception of self as an interchangeable exemplar of some social category and away from the perception of self as a unique person" ([Wetherell, 1987: 50](#)). The concept of collective self includes the phenomenon of identification- through which a person may identify herself to a particular social group. "Throughout their careers, identities can function as points of identification and attachment [sic]" ([Hall, 1996: 5](#)). Roles are then also performed according to an individual's identity, which may be called a role

identity—for example, mother, father, professor, doctor, etc. "The concept of role in sociology, which explicitly involves the expectation that others have about one's behavior, as well as one's expectations about how others will behave toward him, can in part be interpreted in terms of the stability of 'convergent expectations,' of the same type that are involved in [a] coordination game" ([Schelling, 1960: 92](#)). The emergence of the relational and collective self-gave the notion that identities are not fixed. Post-modernism is "an extension of the freely chosen and multiple identities of the modern self that accepts and affirms an unstable and rapidly mutating condition" ([Kellner, 1992: 158](#)). This also acted as liberation and emancipation from the traditional concept of fixity.

In the modern world of today, change and uncertainty are permanent. "To 'be modern' means to modernize-compulsively, obsessively; not so much just 'to be', let alone to keep its identity intact, but forever 'becoming', avoiding completion, staying under-defined" ([Bauman, 1999](#)). Therefore, there is not a single fixed identity of a person; rather, identities are constantly changing, and they are multiple. "Choices that feel identity congruent in one situation do not necessarily feel identity-congruent in another situation. This flexibility is part of what makes the self-useful" ([Leary & Tangney, 2012: 70](#)). Hence, identities are flexible, hybrid, dynamic, and fluid in nature. Amongst various theories of identity, the three most important and widely used theories are identity management theory, social theory of identity, and the communication theory of identity. "Identity Management Theory attempts to explain how cultural identities are negotiated through the development of an interpersonal relationship" ([Cupach & Imahori, 1993: 196](#)). On the other hand, "The social identity approach rests upon certain assumptions concerning the nature of people and society, and their interrelationship" ([Hogg & Abrams, 1988: 13](#)). Communication theory of identity provides a new dimension to the concept of identity by studying the gaps between different layers of a person's identity. Many researchers have used CTI and identify gaps as a theoretical framework in their research studies. For instance, Zadie Smith's novels: *White Teeth* (2001) and *On Beauty* (2006) were analyzed and investigated in detail to find the traces of multiculturalism and cultural identity"

([Hirvonen, 2014: 9](#)). Communication theory of identity has also been used as a framework to find out that how married couples undergo identity gaps while orienting themselves in public ([Lightsey, Martin, LaBelle, & Weber, 2015: 234](#)).

Most of the time, an individual exposed to a new cultural environment and setting undergoes a cultural shock, suffers psychologically, and sometimes becomes a victim of depression and faces the identity crisis as well. Such kind of behavior is most prominently seen in the international students "due to cultural differences and communication barriers, international students' expressions of selves may be restricted when they communicate with members of the host culture" ([Jung, Hecht, & Wadsworth, 2007: 606](#)). The freshman students also undergo the phenomenon of identity gap "when college students enact different identities by succumbing to the pressures of their peers, or when students are inconsistent in the way they present themselves to their peers in order to fulfill certain expectations; these inconsistencies are what constitute identity gaps" ([Rhodes, 2014: 6](#)). The immigrants/migrants do undergo psychological pressure due to the change in place, cultural beliefs, and practices. "Identity is [sic] to describe the way individuals and groups define themselves and are defined by others on the basis of race, ethnicity, religion, language, and culture" ([Deng, 1995: 1](#)). Individuals establish and manage their race, class, gender, and ethnic identities. "But the concepts refer to the individual's psychological relationship to such social units" ([Sherif, 1982: 385](#)). And all of these identities are socially constructed. The association of an individual's identity with a powerful and dominant race, ethnicity, and class automatically excludes and marginalizes the individuals associated to less powerful race, class, and ethnic identity, hence leading to the process of exclusion and that is again a socially constructed categorization. "Thus, for immigrants, the politics of inclusion/exclusion involve a process through which they are located within either an inclusive or exclusive discourse" ([Koegan, 2002: 232](#)), and they are repeatedly seen to suffer from the process of exclusion due to their 'immigrant' or 'migrant' identity.

There is excessive importance of the concept of identity in literature as well. The readers make use of

the concept of identity and theories of identity in order to understand the characters and their ongoing inner conflicts. The Pakistani literature in English is also replete with characters facing an identity crisis and the ones with a quest for identity. The fictional works of Mohsin Hamid, Bapsi Sidhwa, Mohammad Hanif, Daniyal Mueenuddin, Hanif Kureishi, Uzma Aslam Khan, and Kamila Shamsie provide ample instances of identity. Kamila Shamsie “explores the multiple factors -social class and cultural values which influence the notion that identity is not determined by a single factor of nationality or religion, or class but a complex inter-relationship between these and is also the result of a continuous process of formation” ([Lobo, 2018: 724](#)). In her novel *Kartography*, Shamsie deals with the politics of identity, especially the ethnic identity, and explores how some people, by the virtue of their ethnic identity, enjoys all the social, cultural, economic, and political privileges, while others-the ones with the migrant identity are belittled and trivialized.

Research Methodology

In the following, the introduction of the communication theory of identity (CTI) proposed by Michael Hecht and Discourse Analysis (DA) is given:

Communication theory of identity

It describes the multilayered identity and the interpenetration of these layers into one another. It considers the social categorization and social roles of individuals as one of the important aspects of an identity. Moreover, CTI focuses on the involvement of communication in the enactment of identity, and this feature makes it different from the other theories of identity and self. “CTI sees the group and social roles as important aspects of the self, and the categorization and ascription processes as one of the bases by which identity is established and enacted” ([Gudykunst, 2005, p.260](#)). According to the communication theory of identity, there are four layers or frames of identity. The four levels are as under:

1. **Personal layer:** It is a person’s self-concept.
2. **Enacted Layer:** It is an expression of one’s self through behavior and enactment.

3. **Relational layer:** It is how others view/perceive an individual.
4. **Communal layer:** It is the collective or group identity of an individual.
 - **Identify Gaps:** The discrepancies that exist between or among the four layers of identity are called identity gaps ([Jung & Hecht, 2004: 268](#)).
 - **Personal-Relational Identity Gap:** It is the discrepancy between an individual’s personal and ascribed relational identity ([Jung & Hecht, 2004: 268](#)).
 - **Personal-Enacted Identity Gap:** It is the discrepancy between an individual’s personal and enacted identity ([Jung & Hecht, 2004: 269](#)).

Discourse Analysis

Discourse analysis has grabbed the attention of many linguists, sociolinguists, and various researchers and scholars from the field of social sciences and humanities due to its interdisciplinary and descriptive potential. Discourse analysis not only does the linguistic analysis of a written or spoken discourse but also goes beyond the clause and sentence level and studies the social context and interaction of speakers through dialogues ([Stubbs, 1983, p.1](#)). Hence while doing analysis, this approach not only takes into account the text (written or spoken) but the context (social or cultural) as well. In order to test the interdisciplinary nature of the communication theory of identity, it has been applied to a piece of literature: a novel in the present case. The fictive identities are enacted and expressed through dialogues, and in order to analyze the communication being conveyed through a written text of a novel, the Discourse analysis as an interpretive, analytic, and qualitative research method is also applied along with the communication theory of identity to study the identity gaps. Since DA has the potential to analyze and make judgments about a text (written or spoken) due to its interpretative potential. The excerpts relevant to the communication theory of identity and identity gaps are selected from the novel, and Discourse analysis has been used as a mode of inquiry to study the two types of identity gaps: personal-

relational and personal-enacted identity gaps and their implication on the social relationships.

Data Analysis and Discussion

In the following, the passages representing the identified gaps are selected from the novel, *Kartography* and analyzed by the help of the above-stated research tools in order to map out the personal-relational and personal-enacted identity gaps in the fictive characters.

Personal-Relational Identity Gaps in *Kartography* (2001)

Extract 1

"When my father spoke of the need for land reforms to break the power of the feudal, he lost his customary languid posture, and his soft voice took on an edge of urgency. Even at thirteen, I could link his fervor to myriad reasons. The socialist professor who set his mind ablaze when he was at university; the capitalist profession he had entered when he started his own advertising agency..., but all of them, all, were part of the mesh that made up his character. Yet Uncle Asif summarily dismissed all that with one word: muhajir. Immigrant." (Shamsie, 2001: 40)

Context: The female protagonist, Raheen, who was listening to the ongoing conversation between her father, Zafar, and the family friends, narrated the above-stated lines. Zafar being a Marxist, saw the gulf between the bourgeoisie and proletariats and the struggle of the working class to make all the ends meet. He analyzed the conflict in society and empathized with the have-nots for their constant struggle to attain the valuables and riches of life. Therefore, he expressed his viewpoint that land reforms should be introduced in the country because this is the way through which the power will not only remain in the hands of the ruling class and the feudal, rather it will be distributed equally amongst the ruling and laboring class.

Analysis: On expressing his perspective of the implementation of land reforms in the country, Zafar was demeaned by his friend- Asif, who called him an immigrant; Muhajir, who did not have a land of their own and were incomers and settlers. Here, Zafar did undergo the personal- relational identity gap. He considered himself as a native citizen of Pakistan

(personal frame), but his friend ascribed him a migrant identity and viewed him as an outsider (relational frame).

Extract 2

"Do you hear the way people like Zafar and Yasmin talk about "their Karachi"? My family lived there for generations. Who the hell are these Muhajirs to pretend it's their city!" (p.41)

Context: Laila, a family friend of Zafar and Yasmin, said the above-quoted lines. Laila was a Pakistani born and her family had been living in Pakistan since generations.

Analysis: While talking about affiliation, ties, and attachment with the city of Karachi, Laila very categorically said that Karachi is the city of us- the ones who are indigenous and not of the immigrants. She ascribed the tag of Muhajir to her friends, Zafar and Yasmin, and treated them as an outsider because of their migrant identity (relational frame of Zafar and Yasmin). On the other hand, Zafar and Yasmin loved Karachi as much as Laila loved, and they thought of themselves as not an outsider or an immigrant (personal frame). Thus, it showed that there existed a discrepancy between the personal and the relational identity of Zafar and Yasmin because their self-concept was different from what others (friend in the present case) thought of them.

Extract 3

"What kind of immigrant is born in a city and spends his whole life there, and gets married there, and raises his daughter there? And I, an immigrant's daughter, was an immigrant too. I had spent three weeks living in Uncle Asif and Aunt Laila's house; I'd told her about Zia; I'd sat on his shoulder to untangle a kite from the limb of a tree. If I went back to the house and told them I agreed with my father about land reforms if I told them Karachi was my home just as much as it was anyone else's, would they look at me and think: another Muhajir." (p.41)

Context: The female protagonist Raheen spoke the above-quoted lines. She overheard the conversation of her aunt, Laila, who spoke racist and prejudice comments about her lineage and called her parents Muhajir.

Analysis: The Muhajir identity was ascribed to Raheen's family by Laila (relational frame of Raheen and her parents). This incident made Raheen think of classification of human beings on the basis of race and lineage. She asked herself that if an immigrant lived in a city for so long, married there, raised her children there, considered, and loved that city by her heart, still, s/he would be called as an immigrant. What else does one have to do to be called a native? This very incident enabled her to question her own identity as well because earlier, she never thought of herself as different from other people living in the city of Karachi (personal frame). This excerpt from the novel brought forward a gap between the personal and relational identity of Raheen and her parents, whose self-concept was different from how others viewed them (family friend, Laila in the present case).

Extract 4

"Besides, Zaf wasn't acting the polite guest himself. Still, I understand why he said those things. I mean, Muhajirs will never understand the way we feel about land. They all left their homes at Partition. No understanding of ties to a place." (p.39)

Context: Asif, who is the family friend of Zafar and Yasmin, spoke the above-stated lines.

Analysis: Here, Zafar's close friend Asif belittled him because of his immigrant identity. Asif, in a conversation with his wife, demeaned Zafar for being an immigrant and emphasized how an immigrant and an incomer could know the love and connectedness with a land. Asif ascribed and classified Zafar as an immigrant, a Muhajir (relational frame of Zafar), whereas Zafar and his family did not think themselves different from all the other people living in the city of Karachi (personal frame of Zafar).

Extract 5

'Aunt Laila put down the phone and turned to Aba. 'Aren't you? You really pretend to have an objective view of things, Zafar but scratch the surface, and that's one hundred percent Muhajir blood that pours out, isn't it?' That's a pretty violent image,' Ami said. 'Friends don't scratch friends.'" (p.224)

Context: In a conversation with the friends, Zafar talked about the marginalization and exclusion

that people belonging to different races, classes, and gender faced due to the quota system that prevailed in the country. In addition, he stressed that the immigrants, Muhajirs lagged behind in jobs and education due to the restrictions of this quota system.

Analysis: Zafar's friend Laila considered the opinion of Zafar about the quota system as a biased and objective viewpoint. And she called him a Muhajir; an immigrant (relational frame of Zafar). Zafar's friend lowered down him and ascribed a title of a Muhajir to him, whereas he did not associate himself to any specific ethnicity or a social group, rather he thought of himself as a native citizen of Pakistan (personal frame). Here a personal-relational identity gap existed in Zafar because he perceived himself differently from what others (his friends in the present case) thought of him.

Extract 6

"It was true; I knew quite well that there was nothing remarkable about me." (p.33)

Context: In a conversation with Raheen, her uncle Ali asked her what people think of her?

Analysis: Raheen answered the question by highlighting the shining personality traits of her friends, but she could not find a remaking peculiarity about herself and said there was nothing exceptional about her (personal frame of Raheen). This is what Raheen thought of herself, but her American friend Jake had a great admiration for her (relational frame of Raheen), and he expressed it in the following lines: "Ever wonder how other people see you?' I turned around. 'Is this the cruel parting blow, Jake? You going to-what's that funny expression? -hold up a mirror to my eyes?' 'I've never met anyone who knows how to be cruel to you, Raheen. You charm us all. And not, as you think, because you're the life of the party when you're in that partying mood. It's mainly because you'll always find something of worth in even the most useless among us, in even our most pathetic moments. People generally brush away a spider's web, Raheen, but not you." (p.118). This extract represented the gap in Raheen's personal and relational identity because her personal view differed from what others (her friend in the present case) thought of her.

Extract 7

"Yes, hero. What are you? 'Bengali.' Zia and I both turned to look at him in surprise. I'd never once heard Karim identify himself that way." (p.176)

Context: The above-stated excerpt of the novel presents the conversation between the male protagonist, Karim, and a stranger whom he met on the roadside. The stranger seemed frustrated of the marginalization of Muhajirs in every occupation. After listening to his viewpoint on the exploitation of rights, Karim asked him, that are you a Muhajir? In response, the man asked Karim, that who are you? To which Karim responded that he is a Bengali.

Analysis: These lines from the text presented a discrepancy between Karim's personal and relational identity. He considered himself a Bengali because of her maternal family lineage (personal frame of Karim). But his friends never ascribed any ethnic identity to him and never perceived him as different from themselves (relational frame of Karim).

Extract 8

"Tell him not to lie,' Zia yelled back. 'He's not Bengali, he's not. He's, my friend. Why is he lying?' and he raised his foot to kick Karim, raised it back and forward." (p.42)

Context: Zia, who was one of the fast friends of Raheen (female protagonist) and Karim (male protagonist), said the above-stated lines. Zia, while marching forward and backward along with the school building, said to his friends that he was marching like a soldier since he wanted to become a soldier.

Analysis: The conversation among the three friends gradually took another turn, and kids, being unaware of the destruction and devastation of wars, started talking about the wars that Pakistan had with other countries in the past. Adding to this very conversation, Karim said that Pakistan also had one war with Bangladesh, "That's where my mother's from. She's Bengali. That means I'm half- Bengali." (p.42). Zia being unaware of the classification of human beings on the basis of ethnicity and lineage, was infuriated and yelled that Karim was not a Bengali but his friend.

This excerpt of the novel reveals the personal-relational identity gap of Karim. He thought of himself as a half-Bengali (personal frame of Karim), whereas Zia (Karim's friend) thought of him as his friend without any tags of ethnicity (relational frame of Karim).

Extract 9

"I was intelligent enough, attractive enough, witty enough, cool enough." (p.33)

Context: These lines were spoken by Raheen in a conversation with her uncle, Ali.

Analysis: These lines of the text presented the personal frame of Raheen, who thought herself intelligent, attractive, witty, and cool (personal frame of Raheen). She described these traits of her personality to her uncle Ali. Nevertheless, her relational frame was different from her personal frame. One of the reasons for Karim's indifferent attitude towards Raheen was that she did not meet his mother in America while living on the same coast. He kept on expressing his anger and resentment by ignoring her, and one day he openly expressed his rage by saying, "Over three years you've been on the East Coast, and not once have you bothered to call her. You really are your father's daughter." (p.142). This very sentence: "You really are your father's daughter" had a very deep meaning. It was Raheen's father who broke off the engagement with Karim's mother due to her Bengali bloodline, and this horrific truth made Karim think of Zafar an opportunistic and selfish being and whenever Raheen did anything inappropriate, he would call her a true reflection of her father, Zafar (relational frame of Raheen). This shows the discrepancy between Raheen's personal and relational identity because her self- image was different from what others (her friend Karim in the present case) viewed her.

Extract 10

"But I'm not making anything up when I recall Uncle Asif's friend, what his name, the diplomat who stopped at the farm after lunch to drop off a dead quail and, before departing, shook Karim's hand and said, 'So you're Ali's son? I suppose on meeting a young man your age it's customary to ask what you're going to be when you grow up, but no need for that

with you, is there? I expect Ali's already preparing you to take over the linen industry. For three generations your family has kept my family's dining tables looking so elegant. 'No,' Karim said... I'm going to be a map-maker." (p.23).

Context and Analysis: One of the family friends of Karim met him and instantly perceived that he would also follow his family business of linen industries and become a businessman (relational frame of Karim). But surprisingly, Karim expressed his ambition of becoming a cartographer because this is what his personal inclinations, propensities, and interests were and he always perceived himself a cartographer since childhood (personal frame of Karim). This passage of the novel brought forward the discrepancy between Karim's personal and relational identity. Others (his father's friend in the present case) viewed him as a businessman but Karim thought of himself as a cartographer.

Personal-Enacted Identity Gaps in Kartography (2001)

Extract 11

"How can I marry one of them? How can I let one of them bear my children? Think of it as a civic duty. I'll be diluting her Bengali bloodline." (p.232)

Context: Zafar spoke the above lines. This excerpt of the novel hinted towards the events of the civil war of 1971 and unveiled how human relationships suffered due to the affairs of the state. Maheen and Zafar were in love and they were engaged and going to be married soon. Meanwhile, the civil war broke out and the riots and turbulence emerged in the country. Genocide, racism, and extremism were at its peak.

Analysis: During the civil war, a wave of hatred spread across the country for the Bengalis and Zafar had to break off his engagement with Maheen because of her Bengali bloodline. Zafar did that under the pressure of society since he was being labeled as a traitor. It was his moment of error and though he made the decision of breaking off the engagement with Maheen, remained stick to it despite his immense likeliness for Maheen, but deep inside his heart, he carried this burden throughout his life. He was not a racist, but in that moment of error, he did

become a racist, a chauvinist, and a heartless person (enacted frame of Zafar). "Zafar knows what to say, so unforgivable, to make Maheen leave him. He says it. He has succeeded. He has succeeded." (p.335). He had never perceived himself culturally or ethnically superior to Maheen, but at that time, he acted differently from what he had always perceived himself and that was never a racist (personal frame of Zafar). "But your heart has always been far greater than mine, so let me first-please, Maheen, don't stop reading, and if you do, don't throw this away but keep it until such a time as you might be willing to believe that the moment in which I said what I said was not an indication of who I intrinsically am but just the words of a monster who sometimes lurks in the dark corners of my life." (p.311). These aforementioned lines were from an apology letter that he wrote to Maheen. In this letter, he himself confessed that what he did or said at that moment did not depict what he intrinsically was.

This passage of the novel presented the personal-enacted identity gap of Zafar whose self-image was not of a cruel person but he enacted himself like a cruel, heartless person when he called off his engagement with Maheen.

Extract 12

"I opened my mouth to say all this, but to my horror, I found I got no further than 'You're both...' before my voice cracked and a sob constricted my throat." (p.234)

Context: Raheen spoke these lines after getting to know that truth of fiancé swap between her and Karim's parents.

Analysis: Raheen shared a very special bond with her father. She felt happy, loved, and safe in the protective world of her father. Her father meant a world to her and she always felt proud to be called as her father's daughter. When the world did not make sense to her, she asked a question and always got a satisfactory answer from her father. Her father had always stood by her through every thick and thin of life and always tried to inculcate compassion and empathy in Raheen and due to this immense love and inspiration from her father, Raheen started idolizing her father; the one with no imperfections. But the

revelation of haunting truth from her father's past and heartbreaking, derogatory and an unforgivable word that he had spoken to Maheen was too much to break the ideal image of her father and her tender heart as well. Raheen showed a very intense reaction to all this (enacted frame of Raheen) and she said that she could not accept the imperfection in the ideal and perfect personality of her father, whereas in the beginning chapters of the novel, in a letter to Karim, she stated that one should accept one's parent's imperfections. "How're things with you and your mother? I hear you were pretty angry with her in the beginning but we've got to allow our parents their imperfections, right?" (p.132) Hence, there exists a discrepancy between Raheen's personal and enacted identity because she enacted herself differently from what she intrinsically was i.e., a forgivable person.

Extract 13

"I deserve? There was an animal inside me. Karim, I'm sorry. Raheen, I'm so sorry." (p.233)

Context: Zafar spoke the above-quoted lines. He spoke these lines when the truth of fiancé swap was revealed in front of everyone, and Yasmin (Zafar's wife) asked Raheen (daughter of Zafar and Yasmin) that Zafar at least deserved an explanation for calling off the engagement with Maheen.

Analysis: Zafar remained in the state of culpability all his life after speaking prejudice and racist remarks to her dearest and most treasured person, Maheen. And when the past secret of fiancé swap of foursome friends: Ali, Maheen, Zafar, and Yasmin were revealed before Raheen, she became speechless and before she could utter a word, her mother, Yasmin asked her not to judge Zafar through this single incidence and said that he surely deserved an explanation and justification. Zafar did not agree with Yasmin's opinion and confessed that what he did was a cruel act. This very confession and apology of Zafar from Raheen and Karim suggested that he was guilty and ashamed of his actions and represented that Zafar enacted himself differently from what he intrinsically was. He never thought of himself doing such a barbaric act but he did that under the pressure of the society. Hence this passage also shows a gap in Zafar's personal and enacted identity.

Extract 14

"Your friends adore you, Raheen, because at the end of the day you'll always forgive them no matter how hideously they've behaved." (p.119)

Context: Raheen received this compliment of being a forgivable person from her American friend, Jake. However, with the passage of time, her exposure towards the bad and dark realities of the world made her change to some extent since she could not muster up enough courage to forgive her father after getting to know the horrific words and acts done to Maheen by him. She confessed that being so unforgivable and inexpiable towards her father was her weakness and failure of her personality as well and she had to live with this through all her life (enacted frame of Raheen) "I wouldn't say I had forgiven him; more to the point, forgiveness was no longer an issue. He had to live with his failures, just as I had to live with mine." (p.336). These lines of the text also brought forward the contrariety and disparity in Raheen's personal and enacted identity because her self-image was not of someone keeping grievances in the heart, but of a forgivable person. But she enacted herself as an unforgivable person towards her father's past truth.

Extract 15

"He saluted me, and all was forgiven. I never knew how to stay angry with Karim." (p.27)

Context: Raheen says these lines when she was at her uncle's place at Rahim Yar Khan along with Karim.

Analysis: Karim had always been Raheen's companion and best friend since childhood, and she could not imagine her life without Karim and this love for him always make Raheen's heart soft and forgiving even towards his flaws. Raheen always oriented herself as the most understandable and forgivable person. She had always been the incarnation of love and compassion, and this cheerful and compassionate nature did not permit her to hold grievances, grudges, and anger in her heart for a long period. Be it the role of a friend or a daughter, she always performed her role in an efficient and sincere way. Her earnest devotion and pure love for all the people associated with her made her emotional, sensitive and impulsive and that was the reason that

made her angry and indifferent when the people close to her heart did not come up to her expectations since she had her own way of looking and judging the things. The same happened with her friendship with Karim because he did not come up to her expectations and he concealed the secret of the fiancé swap between their parents from Raheen. When she came to know the truth, she was messed up and emotionally confused and in this state of mind, she said to Karim "I don't have anything more to do with either him or you. This friendship is over, Karim" (p.245).

This depicted a personal-enacted identity gap of Raheen since there existed a gap between her personal view and the way she oriented herself in the above stated extract. She was always very kind and forgivable towards Karim and her friendship with his crib companion, Karim was something very dear to her heart and she always cherished it. But in the confused state of mind, she said to end her friendship with him. Hence, this extract of the novel highlighted a discrepancy between her personal and enacted identity.

Conclusion

The present study explored and discussed the two types of identity gaps: personal-relational and personal-enacted identity gaps in the novel,

Kartography. The detailed analysis of the data reveals that the prevailing identity gaps affect the social relationships of an individual, and the characters do suffer psychologically and sociologically due to the mental and emotional stress caused by identity related issues. The analysis of the selected excerpts from the text also reveals that there is a negative effect of personal-relational and personal-enacted identity gaps, such as strife and tension in the social relationships of an individual. The relationship of Zafar, Yasmin, and Raheen with their friends, the fiancé-fiancée relationship of Zafar and Maheen, and the father-daughter relationship of Zafar and Raheen, the relationship of friendship between Raheen and Karim also suffered due to the subsisting identity gaps.

Moreover, from the analysis of the data, it is also concluded that there is a direct relationship between identity gaps and strife in the relationships; the greater the identity gaps, the greater will be the strife in the interpersonal relationships of an individual. Both of the research questions are also answered through the analysis of data with the help of two qualitative approaches: Discourse Analysis and communication theory of identity. The analysis of the text also proved the interdisciplinary nature of CTI hence providing a pathway to other researchers to apply CTI on fictional texts.

References

- Bauman, Z. (1999). *Liquid Modernity*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Benwell, B. & Stokoe, E. (2006). *Discourse and Identity*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Butler, J. (1999). *Gender Trouble: Tenth Anniversary Edition*. New York: Routledge.
- Cupach, W. R., & Imahori, T. T. (1993). Identity Management Theory. In W. Richard & J. Koester (Ed.), *Intercultural Communication Competence* (pp.195-210). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Deng, F. M. (1995). *War of Visions: Conflict of Identities in the Sudan*. Washington, DC: The Brookings Institution.
- Fearon, J. D. (1999). *What is Identity (As We Now Use the Word)?* (Unpublished PhD dissertation). Stanford University, California.
- Gil, T. (2000). The Hermeneutical Anthropology of Charles Taylor. In H. Haring, M.J. Kenny, & D. Mieth (Eds.), *Creating Identity* (pp. 49-59). London: SCM Press.
- Gudykunst, W. B. (2005). *Theorizing about intercultural communication*. Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage.
- Hall, S. (1996). Introduction: Who Needs identity? In S.Hall & P.D. Gay (Ed.), *Questions of Cultural Identity* (pp.1-17). London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Hirvonen, S. (2014). *Cultural Identity Gaps: A Study of Zadie Smith's Novels White Teeth (2001) and On Beauty (2006)* (Unpublished PhD dissertation). University of Jyväskylä, Finland.
- Hogg, M. A., & Abrams, D. (1988). *Social identifications: A Social Psychology of Intergroup Relations and Group Processes*. New York: Routledge.
- Jenkins, R. (1996). *Social Identity*. London: Routledge.
- Jung, E. & Hecht, M. (2004). Elaborating the communication theory of identity: Identity gaps and communication outcomes. *Communication Quarterly*, 52(3), 265-283.
- Jung, E., Hecht, M.L., & Wadsworth, B.C. (2007). The role of identity in international students' psychological well-being in the United States: A model of depression level, identity gaps, discrimination, and acculturation. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 31(5), 605-624.
- Katzenstein, P. J. (1996). *The Culture of National Security: Norms and Identity in World Politics*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kellner, D. (1992). *The Persian Gulf TV War*. Colorado: Westview Press.
- Keogan, K. (2002). A sense of place: The Politics of Immigration and the Symbolic Construction of Identity in Southern California and the New York Metropolitan Area. *Sociological Forum*, 17(2), 223-253.
- Kroskrity, P.V. (2008). Identity. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 9(1-2), 111-114.
- Leary, M. R., & Tangney, J. P. (2012). *Handbook of self and identity* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- Lightsey, C. D., Martin, M. M., LaBelle, S., & Weber, K. (2015). Attachment, Identity Gaps, and Communication and Relational Outcomes in Marital Couples' Public Performances. *Journal of Family Communication*, 15(3), 232-248.
- Lobo, V. (2018). Diasporic Identity and Anxiety in the Select Novels of Kamila Shamsie. *International Journal of English Language, Literature in Humanities*, 6(2), 722-729.
- Potter, J., & Wetherell, M. (1987). *Discourse and Social Psychology: Beyond Attitudes and Behaviour*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Rhodes, J. L. (2014). Loneliness: How Superficial Relationships, Identity Gaps, and Social Support Contribute to Feelings of Loneliness at Pepperdine University. *Pepperdine Journal of Communication Research*, 2(1/3), 1-16.
- Schelling, T. C. (1960). *The Strategy of Conflict*. Oxford: Harvard University Press.
- Shamsie, K. (2001). *Kartography*. London: Bloomsbury.
- Sherif, C. W. (1982). Needed Concepts in the Study of Gender Identity. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 6(4), 375-398.
- Stubbs, M. (1983). *Discourse Analysis: The Sociolinguistic Analysis of Natural Language*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Tajfel, H. & Turner, J. (2004). The Social Identity Theory of Intergroup Behaviour. In J. Jost & J. Sidanius (Eds.), *Political Psychology: Key Readings* (pp.276-293). New York: Psychology Press.

Taylor, C. (1989). *Sources of the self: The Making of the Modern Identity*. United States: Harvard University Press.